Melvin B. Pearlston
Senior Counsel



Of Counsel

Robert B. Hancock

August 6, 2018

## 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Erika McCartney in this matter. Ms. McCartney has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health and Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with the identified products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, Ms. McCartney intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

<u>Alleged Violator</u>. The names of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter "the Violator") is:

# Champlain Chocolate Company

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical.</u> The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Lake Champlain Organic Cacao Powder—Lead

Lake Champlain 80% Dark Organic Chocolates—Cadmium, Lead

Lake Champlain 72% Dark Organic Chocolates—Cadmium, Lead

Lake Champlain 57% Dark Organic Chocolates—Cadmium, Lead

Lake Champlain 54% Dark Chocolates—Cadmium, Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer. On May 1, 1997, the State of California officially listed cadmium as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity.

It should be noted that Ms. McCartney may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, and recommended use of these products. Consequently, the primary route of exposure to these chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least August 6, 2017, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons using these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, Ms. McCartney is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) recall any products already sold, or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provide to those who have received such products; (2) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation. It should be noted that counsel cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who has received this notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement may satisfy the claims alleged herein, such agreement may not be satisfactory to public prosecutors.

Ms. McCartney has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Her address is 1341 58th Ave. # 11, Oakland, California, 94621. Her telephone number is 707.502.8635. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely,

Robert B. Hancock

## Attachments:

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Violators only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

#### Robert B. Hancock declares:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemicals and the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 6, 2018

Robert B. Hancock

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action.

On August 6, 2018, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid and delivery by Certified Mail:

Champlain Chocolate Company c/o Andrew D. Manitsky, Esq. 76 St. Paul Street, Suite 400 Burlington, VT 05401

On August 6, 2018, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(D)(1) on the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed below:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

On August 6, 2018, I served the following Documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto. As to those parties listed by mailing address only, I effected service by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service list attached hereto, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail. As to those parties having an e-mail address listed, I effected service by transmitting the document via electronic transmission to the email address listed.

Executed under penalty of perjury pursuant to the laws of the State of California on August 6, 2018.

Robert B. Hancock

#### Service List

District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

District Attorney, Colusa County 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531 District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney, Riverside County 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92502 Prop65@rivcoda.org District Attorney, Sacramento County 901 "G" Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Room 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

District Attorney,
San Francisco County
850 Bryant Street, Room 322
San Francisco, CA 94103
Gregory.alker@sfgov.org
District Attorney,
San Joaquin County
Post Office Box 990
Stockton, CA 95201
DAConsumer Environmental@sjcda.org District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1035 Palm St. Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Drive Carlton B Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centre, CA 92243

District Attorney, Inyo County 230 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

District Attorney, Los Angeles County 210 West Temple Street, Suite 18000 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001 District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457. nACV Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95353

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney, District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Merced County 2222 M Street Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, Monterey County Post Office Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

District Attorney, Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial St. Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney, Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370 District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2nd Street Woodland, CA 95695 District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Ste 1620 San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov

Office of the City Attorney City of Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814